

V

313

(49)



INDIAN POSTS AND TELEGRAPHS DEPARTMENT.



Received here at - H. - M.

SE HYDERABAD RESY 20-14 MR JINNAH AURANGZIB  
ROAD NEW DELHI

WHEN WFL YOU COME BOMBAY = BAHADURYARJUNG

Signatures of origin at the beginning of this telegram is—class of telegram, time handed in, serial number (is the rate of foreign  
office of origin, date, service instructions (if any) and number of words.  
This form must accompany any inquiry respecting this telegram.

بادریا جٹ  
بمبئی  
20th June 1917

My dear Mr Jinnah

I am very sorry that I  
forgot to send you the copy of  
Mr Jyengar's statement in Bombay.

Now I am sending it with this  
hope that you will

OF HYDERABAD RESY 20-14 MR JINNAH AURANGZIB

ROAD NEW DELHI

WHEN YOU COME BOMBAY = BAHADURYARJUNG

of course at the beginning of this telegram is—class of telegram, time handed in, serial number (in the case of foreign telegrams), office of origin, date, service instructions (if any) and number of words.  
This form must accompany any inquiry respecting this Telegram.

بہادر یار جنگ  
جی۔ آئی۔ اے۔ سی  
20th June 1947

My dear Mr Jinnah

I am very sorry that I  
forgot to send you the copy of  
Mr Jyengar's statement in Bombay.

Now I am sending it with this  
letter and hope that you will  
find it in good health.

Yours sincerely

Bahaduryarjung

In this war our sympathies are undoubtedly with Great Britain and France and we are also opposed to German ideologies. The war, however, has revealed to us deep and unsuspected fissures in International relations and we can no longer reckon upon the survival of old order of things. This war has thrown a searchlight upon the political philosophies we have been deluding ourselves with and we cannot afford to dream of a new world order which will be a better or a more permanent one than that which is passing away. In these days we must lay aside all our own passions and prejudices, all our shibboleths and formulae, and try dispassionately to plan India's present and future.

We need discuss neither Dominion Status nor Independence, neither a Constituent Assembly nor Pakistan. We have to go to the root of our National existence and any national organisation or a State should be built upon National bedrock. It must now be quite clear to the meanest intelligence that Hindus and Muslims cannot range themselves as political communities or parties. That they will continue in a sense to be separate communities for religious purposes must be conceded. Any feeling that the two are different peoples must be ~~prevented~~ prevented from taking hold of us. Probably Muslims generally feel that the superiority of Hindus in numbers and perhaps also in economic position, taking India as a whole, will make the Hindus the dominant political cast and will result in an inferior position for themselves both in politics and in the economic ordering. The Hindus probably feel that the Muslims are not sufficiently national in their outlook and may resort to force against Hindus indulging in extra-territorial ambitions which modify the tempo of Indian patriotism. Probably each community feels that the other is or will be ordinarily against it. In other words, shortly put, the Hindus fear a Muslim Raj and the Muslims fear a Hindu Raj.

The problem to day by no means is so difficult as it used to be when the two communities regarded themselves with some passion as rival religious sects. The differences between the two communities are now more political than others. Reference is sometimes made to cultural differences but this is largely theoretical. The difference in religion and the consequent difference in the personal law together with some difference in language and script are about all. The culture in India is a blended culture and it can hardly be said to be pure Hindu or pure Muslim. There can be no doubt there is much more secular culture in common between the Indian Muslim and the Hindu than between the former and the Turk or Arab. There is, however, one difference between the Hindu and the Indian Muslim. The philosophy of Ahimsa has received enormous attention in these later years and has been egregiously distorted and corrupted to a worthy end. The Ahimsa philosophy of the ordinary secular Hindu was not in the past, however, radically different from the humane culture of the Muslims. It is plain, however, that the Congress with its leadership and its philosophy can never win the permanent trust of Muslims as a body and its amazing ineptitude in this hour of crisis has been demonstrated beyond the shadow of a doubt. The polity of India must be built upon patriotism pure and undefiled. Religion and politics must not be mixed. We must cultivate a sense of racial identity between Hindu and Muslim without any meticulous investigation into past histories and genealogies or any idea of false prestige. The feeling that the Hindus and Muslims in India are two distinct races or nations will always be a stumbling block to any scheme of Hindu-Muslim rule in India. The only basis upon which the two communities can be welded together indissolubly must be wholly secular and racial or national whichever term is preferred.

passion as rival religious sects. The differences between the two communities are now more political than others. Reference is sometimes made to cultural differences but this is largely theoretical. The difference in religion and the consequent difference in the personal law together with some difference in language and script are about all. The culture in India is a blended culture and it can hardly be said to be pure Hindu or pure Muslim. There can be no doubt there is much more of secular culture in common between the Indian Muslim and the Hindu than between the former and the Turk or Arab. There is, however, one difference between the Hindu and the Indian Muslim the philosophy of Ahimsa has received enormous attention in these later years and has been egregiously distorted and corrupted to a worthy end. The Ahimsa philosophy of the ordinary secular Hindu was not in the past, however, radically different from the Islamic culture of the Muslims. It is plain, however, that the Congress with its leadership and its philosophy can never win the permanent trust of Muslims as a body and its amazing ineptitude in this hour of crisis has been demonstrated beyond the shadow of a doubt. The polity of India must be built upon patriotism pure and undefiled. Religion and politics must not be mixed. We must cultivate a sense of racial identity between Hindu and Muslim without any meticulous investigation into past histories and genealogies or any idea of false prestige. Any feeling that the Hindus and Muslims in India are two distinct races or nations will always be a stumbling block to any scheme of Hindu-Muslim rule in India. The only basis upon which the two communities can be welded together indissolubly must be wholly secular and racial or national whichever term is preferred.

The secular state must rest upon the broad foundation of adequate military defence for India and upon the making the people of India reasonably military-minded. The Hindus must

have the same military-mindedness as the Muslims and should not think there is anything wrong in that culture. Neither the ancient Kshtriya tradition nor the military tradition of Western countries has prevented the progress of Arts and Sciences, of industries or of learned professions or of scholarship or anything that is vital in civilization. The present moment offers a supreme opportunity for the two communities to ask for the defence of India being made over to them on a basis of perfect equality of Hindus and Muslims.. The Indian army must consist of equal numbers of Hindus and Muslims and no regiment should be on a communal as distinguished from a regional basis. Every military unit should consist of an equal number of Hindus and Muslims independently of recruits from other communities. We must guard against the result of progressive deterioration in the International situation by building the Indian State on the normal basis of an effective army, navy, air force and so on.

The government of such a state can only be entrusted, not to leaders or followers of the Ahimsa doctrine or of those who indulge in the demagogic crudities which are only disguise by verbal fire-works but to those who are realistic and believe that the world is still governed by force. in the ultimate analysis and that righteousness will prevail against evil only when it is backed by force.

There are grades of military-mindedness and there is no fear for centuries to come of Indians becoming very aggressively military-minded. It is also abundantly clear now that party politics has been mainly responsible for the hopeless inadequacy of Western democracies and that it seriously undermines patriotism and consciously or unconsciously sets hold of

the ancient Kshtriya tradition nor the military tradition of Western countries has prevented the progress of Arts and Sciences, of industries or of learned professions or of scholarship or anything that is vital in civilization. The present moment offers a supreme opportunity for the two communities to ask for the defence of India being made over to them on a basis of perfect equality of Hindus and Muslims.. The Indian army must consist of equal numbers of Hindus and Muslims and no regiment should be on a communal as distinguished from a regional basis. Every military unit should consist of an equal number of Hindus and Muslims independently of recruits from other communities. We must guard against the result of progressive deterioration in the International situation by building the Indian State on the normal basis of an effective army, navy, air force and so on.

The government of such a state can only be entrusted, not to leaders or followers of the Ahimsa doctrine or of those who indulge in the demagogic crudities which are only disguise by verbal fire-works but to those who are realistic and believe that the world is still governed by force - in the ultimate analysis and that righteousness will prevail against evil only when it is backed by force.

There are grades of military-mindedness and there is no fear for centuries to come of Indians becoming very aggressively military-minded. It is also abundantly clear now that party politics has been mainly responsible for the hopeless inadequacy of Western democracies and that it seriously undermine patriotism and consciously or unconsciously gets hold of foreign or international ideologies if not for the purpose but with the result of betraying the country to the invader.

Party politics in India has further the decisive disadvan-

age of keeping the average Hindu and the average Muslim apart. and political parties in India will be either wholly communal or follow some spurious and decadent philosophy which will make them untrustworthy for all purposes of national advancement or of defence in times of crisis.

The governments at the Provinces and at the Centre should therefore, be wholly national governments composed of men who are reasonably military-minded. Having regard to the very large area of communal differences in the country, in every Province as well as at the centre, subject to the special representation of important minorities, Hindu and Muslim ministers should be equal in number in the executive governments of India of the Provinces. We have had enough of the rule of the majority in the West. It has only occasionally been true; when it has been a rule of minority. The Hindu in the Punjab and Frontier and in Bengal and Sind or the Muslim in Bombay and Madras and in United Provinces and Bihar for instance will have no feeling that he is effectively sharing in the administration of the country only if Hindus and Muslims are equal in number in the Cabinet apart from the extra membership that may be given to any other minority community in any Province or at the Centre. This is the only permanent solution which will compel the two communities to trust one another and to acquire the sense of complete racial and national identity. No amount of tinkering with representation in the legislatures or electorate or other arrangements will help to destroy and the deep seated canker of our life. This equal representation in any executive government will give ample confidence to the respective communities throughout India whether in respect of representation in the service or in connection with political or administrative measures. Of course the Hindu Ministers must be elected by the Hindu members of the legislature and the Muslim ministers must be by



of defence in times of crisis.

The governments at the Provinces and at the Centre should therefore, be wholly national governments composed of men who are reasonably military-minded. Having regard to the very large area of communal differences in the country, in every Province as well as at the centre, subject to the special representation of important minorities, Hindu and Muslim ministers should be equal in number in the executive governments of India and of the Provinces. We have had enough of the rule of the majority in the West. It has only occasionally been true; when it has been a rule of minority. The Hindu in the Punjab and Frontier and in Bengal and Sind or the Muslim in Bombay and Madras and in United Provinces and Bihar for instance will have the feeling that he is effectively sharing in the administration of the country only if Hindus and Muslims are equal in number in the Cabinet apart from the extra membership that may be given to any other minority community in any Province or at the Centre. This is the only permanent solution which will compel the two communities to trust one another and to acquire the sense of complete racial and national identity. No amount of tinkering with representation in the legislatures or electorate or other arrangements will help to destroy and the deep seated canker of our life. This equal representation in any executive government will give ample confidence to the respective communities throughout India whether in respect of representation in the service or in connection with political or administrative measures. Of course the Hindu Ministers must be elected by the Hindu members of the legislature and the Muslim ministers must be elected by the Muslim members of the legislature. I certainly favour joint electorates and this scheme will function most

satisfactorily in the system of joint electorates. But experience has shown the intensity of communal feeling in joint electorates also whether the electorates be joint or separate the sharing of power equally in the executive government of every part of the country by the two communities is the one indispensable requisite for complete national consolidation. What is to happen when this equality in representation creates a deadlock is not a matter which requires an anxious discussion. The Cabinet will be hammered into unity as it will be jointly responsible and there will be an extra member or members of the minority communities to give the casting vote. Muslims are apparently anxious that they should have equal representation at least in the Central Legislature. This is not a vital matter when once the Cabinet is formed on national lines and with equal representation for both the major communities. All the entanglements and the confusing proposals are due to our fondness for the system of party politics which should be discarded. The Cabinet is to be removable only on an express vote of no-confidence against the Cabinet as a whole by two-thirds majority of the legislature. The two-thirds majority must be of Hindus and Muslims taken, separately.

The religion, language, and Personal Law of each community should be safeguarded by a paramount constitutional check enabling the majority of members representing that community in the legislature placing a veto upon any legislative or other measure affecting it. A similar veto must be provided against any measure designed or calculated to affect adversely the economic well-being of any community specially. Lastly an adequate communal representation in the services must be agreed to as a practical measure of justice in administration and in the distribution of patronage. The simpler the solution the wider and more lasting will be the trust and satisfaction enjoyed

separate the sharing of power equally in the executive government of every part of the country by the two communities is the one indispensable requisite for complete national consolidation. What is to happen when this equality in representation creates a deadlock is not a matter which requires an anxious discussion. The Cabinet will be hammered into unity as it will be jointly responsible and there will be an extra member or members of the minority communities to give the casting vote. Muslims are apparently anxious that they should have equal representation at least in the Central Legislature. This is not a vital matter when once the Cabinet is formed on national lines and with equal representation for both the major communities. All the entanglements and the confusing proposals are due to our fondness for the system of party politics which should be discarded. The Cabinet is to be removable only on an express vote of no-confidence against the Cabinet as a whole by two-thirds majority of the legislature. The two-thirds majority must be of Hindus and Muslims taken, separately.

The religion, language, and Personal Law of each community should be safeguarded by a Paramount constitutional check enabling the majority of members representing that community in the legislature placing a veto upon any legislative or other measure affecting it. A similar veto must be provided against any measure designed or calculated to affect adversely the economic well-being of any community specially. Lastly an adequate communal representation in the services must be agreed to as a practical measure of justice in administration and in the distribution of patronage. The simpler the solution the wider and more lasting will ~~the~~ be the trust and satisfaction enjoyed by both the communities.

The rule of equality in the executive government is the

--6--

which will solve many of the difficulties in the present and all the difficulties of the future. I do not believe in the efficacy of percentages of communal representation in the legislature which may keep the sore opened or give rise to recurring points of dispute whether the electorate should be joint or separate or what should be the representation of each community in the legislature Central or Provincial appears to be essential and their value is largely historical.

They are not essential to the safeguarding of the rights and interests of the respective communities either of the Province or at the centre on the basis of the scheme outlined above.

What the Hindu and Muslim want to day is that they should be compelled to forget that they are two separate peoples and be able to trust each other in the government of the country. For this purpose neither the Pakistan scheme nor the scheme of weightage or artificially enlarged representation will serve. What the Muslim wants is an equal share in the actual government in the provinces in which his community is in a minority. What the Hindu wants is an equal share in the actual administration in the provinces in which his community is in a minority. No scheme should be set up which would perpetuate communal differences or bring about civil war. Both the major communities are together entitled to rule India. It is only by their joint and equal rule the sense of common nationality and of undivided patriotism will develop. Today partly for want of scope and largely owing to our outworn philosophy we are helpless and divided. If Hindu and Muslim cannot trust one another for the purpose of joint rule and if each has a 'viere pensee' that each can rule or outwit the other there is no salvation for us. And democracy on the basis of national government will be the soundest of democracies and will prevent not only dictatorships but will canalise national endeavour solely to the benefit of the country.

recurring points of dispute whether the electorate should be joint or separate or what should be the representation of each community in the legislature Central or Provincial appears to be essential and their value is largely historical.

They are not essential to the safeguarding of the rights and interests of the respective communities either of the Provinces or at the centre on the basis of the scheme outlined above.

What the Hindu and Muslim want to day is that they should not be compelled to forget that they are two separate peoples and should be enabled to trust each other in the government of the country. For this purpose neither the Pakistan scheme nor the scheme of weightage or artificially enlarged representation will serve. What the Hindu wants is an equal share in the actual government in the Provinces in which his community is in a minority. What the Muslim wants is an equal share in the actual administration in the Provinces in which his community is in a minority. No scheme should be set up which would perpetuate communal differences or bring about civil war. Both the major communities are together entitled to rule India. It is only by their joint and equal rule the sense of common nationality and of undivided patriotism will develop. Today partly for want of scope and largely owing to our outworn philosophy we are helpless and divided. If Hindu and Muslim cannot trust one another for the purpose of joint rule and if each has a 'viere pensee' that each can rule or outwit the other there is no salvation for us. And democracy on the basis of national government will be the soundest of democracies and will prevent not only dictatorships but will canalise national endeavour solely for the benefit of the country.

At this moment with the forgoing aims in view a political organization of a national character is absolutely essential. It

--7--

should sedulously uphold the spirit of non-party patriotism and should consist of an equal number of Muslims and Hindus. Any person is entitled to be a member only if he brings a Muslim in and a Muslim will be entitled to be a member only if he brings a Hindu in. It should steer clear ~~of~~ equally of Congress leadership and policies and of the Muslim League and Hindu Mahasabha leaderships and policies. It should devote itself exclusively to securing the establishment of national government at the Centre and in the Provinces outlined as above unhampered by the ambitions of Congressmen who want to be ministers at all costs by the rule of majority and by the ideologies of Muslim Leaguers who want to set up Islamic States and who do not acknowledge undivided allegiance to India.

The Congress does not command the confidence of the great majority of Muslims and there is no good therefore in trying to perpetuate the present leadership and philosophy of a supine people. The Muslim League is not trusted by Hindus and cannot therefore serve national purpose. An entirely new organization therefore is of the utmost urgency if some of goodwill among the two communities are determined to cut a path along which Indians generally may travel. Such an organization will embody a new type of patriotism determined to discard old party allegiance and to bring into existence an altogether new bond of union.

What have the Muslim to fear in a system where the Muslim ministers cannot be removed except by a two thirds majority of Muslim members in the legislature, where the powers of the legislature does not extend to passing of laws by a majority which affect adversely the interest of any community specially or its language or religion or Personal Law, ~~with~~ where the government of India is joint and equal all over India with the government by

Hindu in. It should steer clear an equally of Congress leader-  
ships and policies and of the Muslim League and Hindu Mahasabha.  
It should devote itself exclusively  
securing the establishment of national government at the Centre  
in the Provinces outlined as above unhampered by the ambitions  
Congressmen who want to be ministers at all costs by the rule  
majority and by the idealogies of Muslim Leaguers who want to  
Islamic States and who do not acknowledge undivided allegi-  
to India.

The Congress does not command the confidence of the great  
majority of Muslims and there is no good therefore in trying to  
The present leadership and philosophy are  
supine people. The Muslim League is not trusted  
and cannot therefore serve national purpose. An  
entirely new organization therefore is of the utmost urgency if  
of goodwill among the two communities are determined to cut a  
path along which Indians generally may travel. Such an  
organization will embody a new type of patriotism determined to  
discard old party allegiance and to bring into existence an alto-  
gether new bond of union.

What have the Muslim to fear in a system where the Muslim  
ministers cannot be removed except by a two thirds majority of  
Muslim members in the legislature, where the powers of the  
legislature does not extend to passing of laws by a majority which  
affect adversely the interest of any community specially or its  
language or religion or Personal Law, ~~with~~ where the government  
Muslim is joint and equal all over India with the government by  
and where adequate communal representation in service is  
guaranteed? And what has the Hindu to fear in a system where  
Muslims rule equally and jointly with Muslim in all the provinces and  
at the centre and where every military unit must be composed

(57)

A.319

33

--8--

of equal members of Hindus and Muslims and where Muslim communalism desert the barren sands of extra-territorial allegiance and engages with the Hindu on the basis of a secular non-party patriotism and leaderships that do not seek to revive old and effete religious creeds but are only devoted to founding a stable polity and free India? The Muslim community in India must feel that its title to rule India in equal measure with the Hindu community is established. And the Hindu community must feel that any adjustments that are made to secure that object do not perpetuate distinctions that must be obliterated or are only starting points for fresh strife--when once this is achieved the rest does not matter.